



List of cases selected for publication in *Reports of Judgments and Decisions* 2014¹

[Updated January 2015]

Notes on citation:

Cases are listed alphabetically by applicant and by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by “[GC]”. Decisions are indicated by “(dec.)”.

Chamber judgments that are not yet “final” within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention² are marked “(not final)”. In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43,³ it will not be published in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2014*, but will be replaced by a judgment or decision from the “Reserve list”.

The volume composition for the years 2014 has not yet been determined. Until further notice, cases of 2014 may be cited simply by indicating the year of publication e.g. ECHR 2014, without adding a volume number. For further information on the manner of citing the Court’s case-law, please see [here](#).

The Court reserves the right to report some or all of the judgments and decisions listed below in the form of extracts. The full original language version or versions of any such judgment or decision will remain available for consultation in the HUDOC database.

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|---|
| I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant..... | 2 |
| II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State | 9 |

1. List approved by the Bureau following recommendation by the Court’s Jurisconsult.

2. Article 44 § 2 of the Convention provides:

“The judgment of a Chamber shall become final

(a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or
(b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or

(c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43.”

3. Article 43 of the Convention provides:

“1. Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.

2. A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.

3. If the panel accepts the request, the Grand Chamber shall decide the case by means of a judgment.”

I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant

A

16.07.2014

[Ališić and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Serbia, Slovenia and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia \[GC\], no. 60642/08](#)

ARTICLE 46

Pilot judgment – General measures

Slovenia and Serbia required to take measures to enable applicants and all others in their position to recover “old” foreign-currency savings

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Inability to recover “old” foreign-currency savings following dissolution of former SFRY: *violation*

B

02.12.2014

[Battista v. Italy, no. 43978/09](#)

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 4

Article 2 § 2

Freedom to leave a country

Prohibition on leaving territory owing to failure to pay child maintenance: *violation*

C

17.07.2014

[Centre for Legal Resources on behalf of Valentin Câmpeanu v. Romania \[GC\], no. 47848/08](#)

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Failure to provide adequate care for HIV positive mental patient: *violation*

ARTICLE 34

Locus standi

Standing of non-governmental organisation to lodge application on behalf of deceased mental patient

ARTICLE 46

Execution of a judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to take general measures to ensure independent representation for the mentally disabled

12.05.2014

[Cyprus v. Turkey \(just satisfaction\) \[GC\], no. 25781/94](#)

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Award to State applicant party in respect of its missing and enclaved citizens in northern Cyprus

D

11.12.2014

[Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic, nos. 28859/11 and 28473/12](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private life

Legislation preventing health professionals assisting with home births: *no violation*

F

12.06.2014

[Fernández Martínez v. Spain \[GC\], no. 56030/07](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private life

Refusal to renew teacher of Catholic religion and morals' contract after he publicly revealed his position as a "married priest": *no violation*

G

03.07.2014

[Georgia v. Russia \(no. 1\) \[GC\], no. 13255/07](#)

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 1

Exhaustion of domestic remedies

Inapplicability of obligation to exhaust owing to administrative practice of arresting, detaining and expelling Georgian nationals: *preliminary objection dismissed*

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL NO. 4

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

Collective expulsion of Georgian nationals by Russian authorities from October 2006 to January 2007

30.09.2014

[Gross v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 67810/10](#)

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 3 (a)

Abuse of the right of application

Failure to inform Court of applicant's death in proceedings concerning her ability to obtain drug enabling her to commit suicide: *inadmissible*

H

13.11.2014

[H. and J. v. the Netherlands \(dec.\), nos. 978/09 and 992/09](#)

ARTICLE 6

Criminal proceedings

Article 6 § 1

Fair hearing

Use in criminal prosecution for torture of statements made on confidential basis in asylum proceedings: *inadmissible*

16.07.2014

[Hämäläinen v. Finland \[GC\], no. 37359/09](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Refusal to give applicant female identity number following sex change unless marriage was transformed into a civil partnership: *no violation*

Positive obligations

Refusal to give applicant female identity number following sex change unless marriage was transformed into a civil partnership: *no violation*

08.07.2014

[Harakchiev and Tolumov v. Bulgaria, nos. 15018/11 and 61199/12](#)

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman or degrading punishment

Whole-life prison regime offering inadequate opportunities of rehabilitation to obtain reduction in sentence: *violation*

[Hassan v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 29750/09](#)

ARTICLE 1

Responsibility of States

Jurisdiction of States

Territorial jurisdiction in relation to detention of Iraqi national by coalition of armed forces in Iraq

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Lawful arrest or detention

Internment in Iraq under Third and Fourth Geneva Conventions: *no violation*

I

16.12.2014

[Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 50541/08, 50571/08, 50573/08 and 40351/09](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 3 (c)

Defence through legal assistance

Delayed access to a lawyer during police questioning owing to exceptionally serious and imminent threat to public safety: *no violation*

J

20.11.2014

[Jaloud v. the Netherlands \[GC\], no. 47708/08](#)

ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of states

Territorial jurisdiction in relation to alleged killing of Iraqi national by Netherlands serviceman, member of Stabilisation Force in Iraq

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

Article 2 § 1

Effective investigation

Failure to hold effective investigation into alleged fatal shooting by Netherlands forces at vehicle checkpoint in southern Iraq: *violation*

14.01.2014

[Jones and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 34356/06 and 40528/06](#)

ARTICLE 6

Criminal proceedings

Article 6 § 1

Access to court

Decision to strike out civil claims alleging torture on account of immunity invoked by defendant State (the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia) and its officials: *no violation*

K

12.3.2014

[Kurić and Others v. Slovenia \(just satisfaction\) \[GC\], no. 26828/06](#)

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Award in respect of pecuniary damage incurred by the applicants as a result of unlawful removal from the Register of Permanent Residents

ARTICLE 46

Pilot judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to introduce and implement ad hoc domestic compensation scheme

M

8.4.2014

[Magyar Keresztény Mennonita Egyház and Others v. Hungary, nos. 70945/11, 23611/12, 26998/12, 41150/12, 41155/12, 41463/12, 41553/12, 54977/12 and 56581/12](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Applicant churches required to re-register for incorporate status in order to regain material benefits from the State: *violation*

27.5.2014

[Marguš v. Croatia \[GC\], no. 4455/10](#)

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

Right not to be tried or punished twice

Conviction for war crimes of a soldier who had previously been granted an amnesty:
Article 4 of Protocol No. 7 not applicable

26.6.2014

[Mennesson v. France, no. 65192/11](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Refusal to grant legal recognition in France to parent-child relationships that had been legally established in the United States between children born as a result of surrogacy treatment and the couples who had had the treatment: *violation*

17.09.2014

[Mocanu and Others v. Romania \[GC\], nos. 10865/09, 45886/07 and 32431/08](#)

ARTICLE 2

Life

Effective investigation

Lack of investigation into death of man during June 1990 demonstrations against Romanian regime: *violation*

ARTICLE 3

Effective investigation

Lack of effective investigation into arrest and ill-treatment of man during June 1990 demonstrations against Romanian regime: *violation*

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 1

Six-month period

Inaction on part of applicant who took eleven years to make complaint to domestic authorities: *preliminary objection dismissed*

Article 35 § 3 (a)

Competence *ratione temporis*

Four years between the triggering event and the Convention's entry into force in respect of Romania: *preliminary objection dismissed*

N

8.4.2014

[National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers v. the United Kingdom, no. 31045/10](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Ban on taking secondary industrial action against an employer not party to a labour dispute: *no violation*

29.4.2014

[Natsvlishvili and Togonidze v. Georgia, no. 9043/05](#)

ARTICLE 6

Criminal proceedings

Article 6 § 1

Fair hearing

Conviction without the examination of the merits of the case following a plea bargain: *no violation*

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

Right of appeal in criminal matters

Lack of right of appeal against conviction following plea bargain: *no violation*

22.4.2014

[Nusret Kaya and Others v. Turkey, nos. 43750/06, 43752/06, 32054/08, 37753/08 and 60915/08](#)

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for correspondence Respect for family life

Restriction on Turkish prisoners using Kurdish when telephoning: *violation*

O

28.1.2014

[O'Keefe v. Ireland \[GC\], no. 35810/09](#)

ARTICLE 3

Positive obligations

Failure by State to put appropriate mechanisms in place to protect National School pupil from sexual abuse by teacher: *violation*

S

01.07.2014

[S.A.S. v. France \[GC\], no. 43835/11](#)

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for private life

Ban on wearing religious face covering in public: *no violation*

ARTICLE 9

Article 9 § 1

Manifest religion or belief

Ban on wearing religious face covering in public: *no violation*

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination

Ban on wearing religious face covering in public: *no violation*

17.07.2014

[Svinarenko and Slyadnev v. Russia \[GC\], nos. 32541/08 and 43441/08](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Use of metal cage to hold defendants during criminal trial: *violation*

T

04.11.2014

[Tarakhel v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 29217/12](#)

ARTICLE 3

Expulsion

Proposed removal of Afghan asylum-seeker family to Italy under Dublin II Regulation: *expulsion would constitute a violation*

04.09.2014

[Trabelsi v. Belgium, no. 140/10](#)

ARTICLE 3

Extradition

Extradition to a non-Contracting State where applicant faces risk of irreducible life sentence if convicted: *violation*

ARTICLE 34

Hinder the exercise of the right of application

Extradition to United States despite real risk of irreducible life sentence without parole and in breach of interim measure ordered by European Court: *violation*

V

27.05.2014

[Velyo Velev v. Bulgaria, no. 16032/07](#)

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Right to education

Refusal to enrol remand prisoner in prison school: *violation*

25.03.2014

[Vistiņš and Perepjolkins v. Latvia \(just satisfaction\) \[GC\], no. 71243/01](#)

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Compensation for expropriation based on equitable considerations

II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State

Belgium

04.09.2014

[Trabelsi v. Belgium, no. 140/10](#)

ARTICLE 3

Extradition

Extradition to a non-Contracting State where applicant faces risk of irreducible life sentence if convicted: *violation*

ARTICLE 34

Hinder the exercise of the right of application

Extradition to United States despite real risk of irreducible life sentence without parole and in breach of interim measure ordered by European Court: *violation*

Bosnia-Herzegovina

16.07.2014

[Ališić and Others v. Bosnia and Herzegovina, Croatia, Serbia, Slovenia and the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia \[GC\], no. 60642/08](#)

ARTICLE 46

Pilot judgment – General measures

Slovenia and Serbia required to take measures to enable applicants and all others in their position to recover “old” foreign-currency savings

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL NO. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Inability to recover “old” foreign-currency savings following dissolution of former SFRY: *violation*

Bulgaria

27.05.2014

[Velyo Velev v. Bulgaria, no. 16032/07](#)

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Right to education

Refusal to enrol remand prisoner in prison school: *violation*

08.07.2014

[Harakchiev and Tolumov v. Bulgaria, nos. 15018/11 and 61199/12](#)

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman or degrading punishment

Whole-life prison regime offering inadequate opportunities of rehabilitation to obtain reduction in sentence: *violation*

Croatia

27.5.2014

[Marguš v. Croatia \[GC\], no. 4455/10](#)

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

Right not to be tried or punished twice

Conviction for war crimes of a soldier who had previously been granted an amnesty:
Article 4 of Protocol No. 7 not applicable

Czech Republic

11.12.2014

[Dubská and Krejzová v. the Czech Republic, nos. 28859/11 and 28473/12](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private life

Legislation preventing health professionals assisting with home births: *no violation*

Finland

16.07.2014

[Hämäläinen v. Finland \[GC\], no. 37359/09](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Refusal to give applicant female identity number following sex change unless marriage was transformed into a civil partnership: *no violation*

Positive obligations

Refusal to give applicant female identity number following sex change unless marriage was transformed into a civil partnership: *no violation*

France

26.6.2014

[Mennesson v. France, no. 65192/11](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private and family life

Refusal to grant legal recognition in France to parent-child relationships that had been legally established in the United States between children born as a result of surrogacy treatment and the couples who had had the treatment: *violation*

01.07.2014

[S.A.S. v. France \[GC\], no. 43835/11](#)

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for private life

Ban on wearing religious face covering in public: *no violation*

ARTICLE 9

Article 9 § 1

Manifest religion or belief

Ban on wearing religious face covering in public: *no violation*

Article 14

Discrimination

Ban on wearing religious face covering in public: *no violation*

Georgia

29.4.2014

[Natsvlishvili and Togonidze v. Georgia, no. 9043/05](#)

ARTICLE 6

Criminal proceedings

Article 6 § 1

Fair hearing

Conviction without the examination of the merits of the case following a plea bargain: *no violation*

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 7

Right of appeal in criminal matters

Lack of right of appeal against conviction following plea bargain: *no violation*

Hungary

8.4.2014

[Magyar Keresztény Mennonita Egyház and Others v. Hungary, nos. 70945/11, 23611/12, 26998/12, 41150/12, 41155/12, 41463/12, 41553/12, 54977/12 and 56581/12](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Applicant churches required to re-register for incorporate status in order to regain material benefits from the State: *violation*

Ireland

28.1.2014

[O'Keefe v. Ireland \[GC\], no. 35810/09](#)

ARTICLE 3

Positive obligations

Failure by State to put appropriate mechanisms in place to protect National School pupil from sexual abuse by teacher: *violation*

Italy

02.12.2014

[Battista v. Italy, no. 43978/09](#)

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL NO. 4

Article 2 § 2

Freedom to leave a country

Prohibition on leaving territory owing to failure to pay child maintenance: *violation*

Latvia

25.03.2014

[Vistiņš and Perepiolkins v. Latvia \(just satisfaction\) \[GC\], no. 71243/01](#)

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Compensation for expropriation based on equitable considerations

Netherlands

13.11.2014

[H. and J. v. the Netherlands \(dec.\), nos. 978/09 and 992/09](#)

ARTICLE 6

Criminal proceedings

Article 6 § 1

Fair hearing

Use in criminal prosecution for torture of statements made on confidential basis in asylum proceedings: *inadmissible*

20.11.2014

[Jaloud v. the Netherlands \[GC\], no. 47708/08](#)

ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of states

Territorial jurisdiction in relation to alleged killing of Iraqi national by Netherlands serviceman, member of Stabilisation Force in Iraq

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

Article 2 § 1

Effective investigation

Failure to hold effective investigation into alleged fatal shooting by Netherlands forces at vehicle checkpoint in southern Iraq: *violation*

Romania

17.07.2014

[Centre for Legal Resources on behalf of Valentin Câmpeanu v. Romania \[GC\], no. 47848/08](#)

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations (substantive aspect)

Failure to provide adequate care for HIV positive mental patient: *violation*

ARTICLE 34

Locus standi

Standing of non-governmental organisation to lodge application on behalf of deceased mental patient

ARTICLE 46

Execution of a judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to take general measures to ensure independent representation for the mentally disabled

17.09.2014

[Mocanu and Others v. Romania \[GC\], nos. 10865/09, 45886/07 and 32431/08](#)

ARTICLE 2

Life

Effective investigation

Lack of investigation into death of man during June 1990 demonstrations against Romanian regime: *violation*

ARTICLE 3

Effective investigation

Lack of effective investigation into arrest and ill-treatment of man during June 1990 demonstrations against Romanian regime: *violation*

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 1

Six-month period

Inaction on part of applicant who took eleven years to make complaint to domestic authorities: *preliminary objection dismissed*

Article 35 § 3 (a)

Competence *ratione temporis*

Four years between the triggering event and the Convention's entry into force in respect of Romania: *preliminary objection dismissed*

Russia

03.07.2014

[Georgia v. Russia \(no. 1\) \[GC\], no. 13255/07](#)

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 1

Exhaustion of domestic remedies

Inapplicability of obligation to exhaust owing to administrative practice of arresting, detaining and expelling Georgian nationals: *preliminary objection dismissed*

ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL NO. 4

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

Collective expulsion of Georgian nationals by Russian authorities from October 2006 to January 2007

17.07.2014

[Svinarenko and Slyadnev v. Russia \[GC\], nos. 32541/08 and 43441/08](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Use of metal cage to hold defendants during criminal trial: *violation*

Slovenia

12.3.2014

[Kurić and Others v. Slovenia \(just satisfaction\) \[GC\], no. 26828/06](#)

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Award in respect of pecuniary damage incurred by the applicants as a result of unlawful removal from the Register of Permanent Residents

ARTICLE 46

Pilot judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to introduce and implement ad hoc domestic compensation scheme

Spain

12.06.2014

[Fernández Martínez v. Spain \[GC\], no. 56030/07](#)

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private life

Refusal to renew teacher of Catholic religion and morals' contract after he publicly revealed his position as a "married priest": *no violation*

Switzerland

30.09.2014

[Gross v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 67810/10](#)

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 3 (a)

Abuse of the right of application

Failure to inform Court of applicant's death in proceedings concerning her ability to obtain drug enabling her to commit suicide: *inadmissible*

04.11.2014

[Tarakhel v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 29217/12](#)

ARTICLE 3

Expulsion

Proposed removal of Afghan asylum-seeker family to Italy under Dublin II Regulation: *expulsion would constitute a violation*

Turkey

22.4.2014

[Nusret Kaya and Others v. Turkey, nos. 43750/06, 43752/06, 32054/08, 37753/08 and 60915/08](#)

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for correspondence Respect for family life

Restriction on Turkish prisoners using Kurdish when telephoning: *violation*

12.05.2014

[Cyprus v. Turkey \(just satisfaction\) \[GC\], no. 25781/94](#)

ARTICLE 41

Just satisfaction

Award to State applicant party in respect of its missing and enclaved citizens in northern Cyprus

United Kingdom

14.1.2014

[Jones and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 34356/06 and 40528/06](#)

ARTICLE 6

Criminal proceedings

Article 6 § 1

Access to court

Decision to strike out civil claims alleging torture on account of immunity invoked by defendant State (the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia) and its officials: *no violation*

8.4.2014

[National Union of Rail, Maritime and Transport Workers v. the United Kingdom, no. 31045/10](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Ban on taking secondary industrial action against an employer not party to a labour dispute: *no violation*

16.09.2014

[Hassan v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 29750/09](#)

ARTICLE 1

Responsibility of States

Jurisdiction of States

Territorial jurisdiction in relation to detention of Iraqi national by coalition of armed forces in Iraq

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Lawful arrest or detention

Internment in Iraq under Third and Fourth Geneva Conventions: *no violation*

16.12.2014

[Ibrahim and Others v. the United Kingdom, nos. 50541/08, 50571/08, 50573/08 and 40351/09](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 3 (c)

Defence through legal assistance

Delayed access to a lawyer during police questioning owing to exceptionally serious and imminent threat to public safety: *no violation*