



List of cases selected for publication in *Reports of Judgments and Decisions* 2013¹

[Updated June 2014]

Notes on citation:

Cases are listed alphabetically by applicant and by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by “[GC]”. Decisions are indicated by “(dec.)”.

Chamber judgments that are not yet “final” within the meaning of Article 44 of the Convention² are marked “(not final)”. In the event that any such judgment is accepted for referral to the Grand Chamber in accordance with Article 43,³ it will not be published in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2013*, but will be replaced by a judgment or decision from the “Reserve list”.

The volume composition for the years 2013 has not yet been determined. Until further notice, cases of 2013 may be cited simply by indicating the year of publication e.g. ECHR 2013, without adding a volume number. For further information on the manner of citing the Court’s case-law, please see [here](#).

The Court reserves the right to report some or all of the judgments and decisions listed below in the form of extracts. The full original language version or versions of any such judgment or decision will remain available for consultation in the HUDOC database.

Table of Contents

I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant.....	2
II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State	9

¹ List approved by the Bureau following recommendation by the Court’s Jurisconsult.

² Article 44 § 2 of the Convention provides:

“The judgment of a Chamber shall become final

(a) when the parties declare that they will not request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber; or
(b) three months after the date of the judgment, if reference of the case to the Grand Chamber has not been requested; or

(c) when the panel of the Grand Chamber rejects the request to refer under Article 43.”

³ Article 43 of the Convention provides:

“1. Within a period of three months from the date of the judgment of the Chamber, any party to the case may, in exceptional cases, request that the case be referred to the Grand Chamber.

2. A panel of five judges of the Grand Chamber shall accept the request if the case raises a serious question affecting the interpretation or application of the Convention or the Protocols thereto, or a serious issue of general importance.

3. If the panel accepts the request, the Grand Chamber shall decide the case by means of a judgment.”

I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant

A

12.7.2013

[Allen v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 25424/09](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 2

Presumption of innocence

Refusal of compensation following reversal of applicant's conviction of criminal offence: *no violation*

22.4.2013

[Animal Defenders International v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 48876/08](#)

ARTICLE 10

Article 10 § 1

Freedom of expression

Refusal of permission for non-governmental organisation to place television advert owing to statutory prohibition of political advertising: *no violation*

D

21.10.2013

[Del Río Prada v. Spain \[GC\], no. 42750/09](#)

ARTICLE 7

Article 7 § 1

Heavier penalty

Postponement of date of applicant's release following change in case-law after she was sentenced: *violation*

E

15.1.2013

[Eweida and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 48420/10](#)

ARTICLE 9

Manifest religion or belief

Disciplinary measures against employees for wearing religious symbols (cross) at work or refusing to perform duties they considered incompatible with their religious beliefs: *violation; no violations*

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 9)

Disciplinary measures against employees for wearing religious symbols (cross) at work or refusing to perform duties they considered incompatible with their religious beliefs: *violation; no violations*

F

7.2.2013

[Fabris v. France \[GC\], no. 16574/08](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

Difference in treatment of legitimate and illegitimate children for succession purposes: *violation*

G

15.10.2013

[Gutsanovi v. Bulgaria, no. 34529/10, \(extracts – Article 3\)](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Heavy-handed nature of police operation to arrest politician at his home in the presence of his wife and minor children: *violation*

I

3.10.2013

[I.B. v. Greece, no. 552/10](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination

Dismissal, as a result of pressure from colleagues, of employee suffering from HIV infection: *violation*

J

21.10.2013

[Janowiec and Others v. Russia \[GC\], nos. 55508/07 and 29520/09](#)

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman treatment

Positive obligations

Alleged failure adequately to account for fate of Polish prisoners executed by Soviet secret police at Katyń in 1940: *no violation*

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 3

Ratione temporis

Court's temporal jurisdiction in respect of deaths that occurred 58 years before the Convention entered into force in respondent State: *preliminary objection allowed*

ARTICLE 38

Article 38 § 1 (a)

Obligation to furnish all necessary facilities

Refusal on grounds of national security to provide copy of domestic court decision to discontinue criminal investigation into Katyń massacre: *failure to comply with Article 38*

L

20.6.2013

[Lavrechov v. the Czech Republic, no. 57404/08](#)

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Forfeiture of applicant's bail notwithstanding his acquittal: *no violation*

M

18.7.2013

[Maktouf and Damjanović v. Bosnia and Herzegovina \[GC\], nos. 2312/08 and 34179/08](#)

ARTICLE 7

Article 7 § 1

Heavier penalty

Retrospective application of criminal law laying down heavier sentences for war crimes than the law in force when the offences were committed: *violation*

16.7.2013

[McCaughey and Others v. the United Kingdom, 43098/09](#)

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

Article 2 § 1

Effective investigation

Excessive delay in investigation into deaths at the hands of security forces in Northern Ireland: *violation*

ARTICLE 46

Article 46 § 2

Execution of judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent State required to take all necessary and appropriate measures to ensure expeditious compliance with procedural requirements of Article 2 in cases concerning killings by the security forces in Northern Ireland

23.7.2013

[M.A. v. Cyprus, no. 41872/10, 23.7.2013 \(extracts\)](#)

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty

Transfer and stay at police headquarters of a group of immigrants with a view to identifying and deporting unlawful residents: *violation*

9.4.2013

[Mehmet Şentürk and Bekir Şentürk v. Turkey, no. 13423/09](#)

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

Refusal to carry out urgent operation on pregnant woman owing to her inability to pay medical fees: *violation*

O

9.1.2013

[Oleksandr Volkov v. Ukraine, no. 21722/11](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

Fair hearing

Absence of limitation period for imposing disciplinary penalty on judges and abuse of electronic vote system in Parliament when adopting decision on judge's dismissal: *violations*

Independent tribunal

Impartial tribunal

Structural defects of the system of judicial discipline: *violation*

Tribunal established by law

Composition of chamber examining applicant's case defined by a judge whose term of office as court's president had expired: *violation*

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private life

Dismissal of a judge for "breach of oath" in absence of consistent interpretation of that offence and of requisite procedural safeguards: *violation*

ARTICLE 46

Execution of judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to reform the system of judicial discipline

Execution of judgment – Individual measures

Respondent State required to secure applicant's reinstatement in the post of judge of the Supreme Court at the earliest possible date

S

6.6.2013

[Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia, no. 38450/05](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Inhuman treatment

Statutory ban on returning the bodies of terrorists for burial: *admissible*

Appalling conditions of storage of the bodies of the applicants' deceased relatives: *admissible*

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for family life

Respect for private life

Statutory ban on returning the bodies of terrorists for burial: *admissible*

25.4.2013

[Savridin Dzhurayev v. Russia, no. 71386/10](#)

ARTICLE 34

Hinder the exercise of the right of petition

Forcible transfer of person to the Tajikistan with real risk of treatment and circumvention of the interim measures ordered by the Court

ARTICLE 46

Execution of judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent state required without delay to ensure the lawfulness of State action in extradition and expulsion cases and the effective protection of potential victims

Execution of judgment

Individual measures

Respondent State required to take tangible remedial measures to protect the applicant against the existing risks to his life and health in a foreign jurisdiction

9.7.2013

[Sindicatul "Păstorul cel Bun" v. Romania \[GC\], no. 2330/09](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Refusal to register a trade union for priests on account of the autonomy of religious communities: *no violation*

12.11.2013

[Söderman v. Sweden \[GC\], no. 5786/08](#)

ARTICLE 8

Positive obligations

Article 8 § 1

Respect for private life

Lack of clear statutory provisions criminalising act of covertly filming a naked child: *violation*

11.6.2013

[Stichting Mothers of Srebrenica and Others v. the Netherlands \(dec.\), no. 65542/12](#)

ARTICLE 6

Right to a fair trial

Decision of Netherlands courts to decline jurisdiction to hear claim against the UN arising out of the Srebrenica massacre: *inadmissible*

T

2.4.2013

[Tarantino and Others v. Italy, nos. 25851/09, 29284/09 and 64090/09](#)

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Right to education

Legislation imposing entrance examination with numerus clausus for access to public and private sector university courses in medicine and dentistry: *no violation*

V

7.11.2013

[Vallianatos and Others v. Greece \[GC\], nos. 29381/09 and 32684/09](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination

Exclusion of same-sex couples from "civil unions": violation

9.7.2013

[Vinter and Others v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], nos. 66069/09, 130/10 and 3896/10](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Inhuman treatment

Imprisonment for life with release possible only in the event of terminal illness or serious incapacitation: *violation*

9.7.2013

[Vona v. Hungary, no. 35943/10](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Dissolution of association involved in anti-Roma rallies and paramilitary parading: *no violation*

W

8.1.2013

[Willcox and Hurford v. the United Kingdom \(dec.\), nos. 43759/10 and 43771/12](#)

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman punishment

Degrading punishment

Continued enforcement in United Kingdom pursuant to prisoner transfer agreement of lengthy sentence imposed by Thai courts: *inadmissible*

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty

After conviction

Continued enforcement in United Kingdom pursuant to prisoner transfer agreement of lengthy sentence imposed by Thai courts: *inadmissible*

X

26.11.2013

[X v. Latvia \[GC\], no. 27853/09](#)

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for family life

Failure to conduct detailed examination of all relevant points when deciding whether to return a child pursuant to Hague Convention: *violation*

19.2.2013

[X and Others v. Austria \[GC\], no. 19010/07](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 8)

Impossibility of second-parent adoption in same-sex couple: *violation*

Z

29.1.2013

[Zolotas v. Greece \(no. 2\), no. 66610/09](#)

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Accrual to State of monies on bank accounts that had become irrecoverable owing to operation of statutory limitation period: *violation*

26.3.2013

[Zorica Jovanović v. Serbia, no. 21794/08](#)

ARTICLE 8

Positive obligations

Respect for family life

Continuing failure to provide information concerning fate of newborn baby in hospital care: *violation*

ARTICLE 46

Execution of a judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to take appropriate measures to establish a mechanism of redress for all parents of missing newborn children

II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State

Austria

19.2.2013

[X and Others v. Austria \[GC\], no. 19010/07](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 8)

Impossibility of second-parent adoption in same-sex couple: *violation*

Bosnia and Herzegovina

18.7.2013

[Maktouf and Damjanović v. Bosnia and Herzegovina \[GC\], nos. 2312/08 and 34179/08](#)

ARTICLE 7

Article 7 § 1

Heavier penalty

Retrospective application of criminal law laying down heavier sentences for war crimes than the law in force when the offences were committed: *violation*

Bulgaria

15.10.2013

[Gutsanovi v. Bulgaria, no. 34529/10, \(extracts – Article 3\)](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Heavy-handed nature of police operation to arrest politician at his home in the presence of his wife and minor children: *violation*

Cyprus

23.7.2013

[M.A. v. Cyprus, no. 41872/10, 23.7.2013 \(extracts\)](#)

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty

Transfer and stay at police headquarters of a group of immigrants with a view to identifying and deporting unlawful residents: *violation*

Czech Republic

20.6.2013

[Lavrechov v. the Czech Republic, no. 57404/08](#)

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Forfeiture of applicant's bail notwithstanding his acquittal: *no violation*

France

7.2.2013

[Fabris v. France \[GC\], no. 16574/08](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

Difference in treatment of legitimate and illegitimate children for succession purposes: *violation*

Greece

29.1.2013

[Zolotas v. Greece \(no. 2\), no. 66610/09](#)

ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Peaceful enjoyment of possessions

Accrual to State of monies on bank accounts that had become irrecoverable owing to operation of statutory limitation period: *violation*

3.10.2013

[I.B. v. Greece, no. 552/10](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination

Dismissal, as a result of pressure from colleagues, of employee suffering from HIV infection: *violation*

7.11.2013

[Vallianatos and Others v. Greece \[GC\], nos. 29381/09 and 32684/09](#)

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination

Exclusion of same-sex couples from "civil unions": *violation*

Hungary

9.7.2013

[Vona v. Hungary, no. 35943/10](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Dissolution of association involved in anti-Roma rallies and paramilitary parading: *no violation*

Italy

2.4.2013

[Tarantino and Others v. Italy, nos. 25851/09, 29284/09 and 64090/09](#)

ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Right to education

Legislation imposing entrance examination with numerus clausus for access to public and private sector university courses in medicine and dentistry: *no violation*

Latvia

26.11.2013

[X v. Latvia \[GC\], no. 27853/09](#)

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for family life

Failure to conduct detailed examination of all relevant points when deciding whether to return a child pursuant to Hague Convention: *violation*

Netherlands

11.6.2013

[Stichting Mothers of Srebrenica and Others v. the Netherlands \(dec.\), no. 65542/12](#)

ARTICLE 6

Right to a fair trial

Decision of Netherlands courts to decline jurisdiction to hear claim against the UN arising out of the Srebrenica massacre: *inadmissible*

Romania

9.7.2013

[Sindicatul "Păstorul cel Bun" v. Romania \[GC\], no. 2330/09](#)

ARTICLE 11

Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Refusal to register a trade union for priests on account of the autonomy of religious communities: *no violation*

Russia

25.4.2013

[Savriddin Dzhurayev v. Russia, no. 71386/10](#)

ARTICLE 34

Hinder the exercise of the right of petition

Forcible transfer of person to the Tajikistan with real risk of treatment and circumvention of the interim measures ordered by the Court

ARTICLE 46

Execution of judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent state required without delay to ensure the lawfulness of State action in extradition and expulsion cases and the effective protection of potential victims

Execution of judgment

Individual measures

Respondent State required to take tangible remedial measures to protect the applicant against the existing risks to his life and health in a foreign jurisdiction

6.6.2013

[Sabanchiyeva and Others v. Russia, no. 38450/05](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Inhuman treatment

Statutory ban on returning the bodies of terrorists for burial: *admissible*
Appalling conditions of storage of the bodies of the applicants' deceased relatives: *admissible*

ARTICLE 8

Article 8 § 1

Respect for family life

Respect for private life

Statutory ban on returning the bodies of terrorists for burial: *admissible*

21.10.2013

[Janowiec and Others v. Russia \[GC\], nos. 55508/07 and 29520/09](#)

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman treatment

Positive obligations

Alleged failure adequately to account for fate of Polish prisoners executed by Soviet secret police at Katyń in 1940: *no violation*

ARTICLE 35

Article 35 § 3

Ratione temporis

Court's temporal jurisdiction in respect of deaths that occurred 58 years before the Convention entered into force in respondent State: *preliminary objection allowed*

ARTICLE 38

Article 38 § 1 (a)

Obligation to furnish all necessary facilities

Refusal on grounds of national security to provide copy of domestic court decision to discontinue criminal investigation into Katyń massacre: *failure to comply with Article 38*

Serbia

26.3.2013

[Zorica Jovanović v. Serbia, no. 21794/08](#)

ARTICLE 8

Positive obligations

Respect for family life

Continuing failure to provide information concerning fate of newborn baby in hospital care: *violation*

ARTICLE 46

Execution of a judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to take appropriate measures to establish a mechanism of redress for all parents of missing newborn children

Spain

21.10.2013

[Del Río Prada v. Spain \[GC\], no. 42750/09](#)

ARTICLE 7

Article 7 § 1

Heavier penalty

Postponement of date of applicant's release following change in case-law after she was sentenced: *violation*

Sweden

12.11.2013

[Söderman v. Sweden \[GC\], no. 5786/08](#)

ARTICLE 8

Positive obligations

Article 8 § 1

Respect for private life

Lack of clear statutory provisions criminalising act of covertly filming a naked child: *violation*

Turkey

9.4.2013

[Mehmet Şentürk and Bekir Şentürk v. Turkey, no. 13423/09](#)

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

Refusal to carry out urgent operation on pregnant woman owing to her inability to pay medical fees: *violation*

Ukraine

9.1.2013

[Oleksandr Volkov v. Ukraine, no. 21722/11](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 1 (civil)

Fair hearing

Absence of limitation period for imposing disciplinary penalty on judges and abuse of electronic vote system in Parliament when adopting decision on judge's dismissal: *violations*

Independent tribunal

Impartial tribunal

Structural defects of the system of judicial discipline: *violation*

Tribunal established by law

Composition of chamber examining applicant's case defined by a judge whose term of office as court's president had expired: *violation*

ARTICLE 8

Respect for private life

Dismissal of a judge for "breach of oath" in absence of consistent interpretation of that offence and of requisite procedural safeguards: *violation*

ARTICLE 46

Execution of judgment – General measures

Respondent State required to reform the system of judicial discipline

Execution of judgment – Individual measures

Respondent State required to secure applicant's reinstatement in the post of judge of the Supreme Court at the earliest possible date

United Kingdom

8.1.2013

[Willcox and Hurford v. the United Kingdom \(dec.\), nos. 43759/10 and 43771/12](#)

ARTICLE 3

Inhuman punishment

Degrading punishment

Continued enforcement in United Kingdom pursuant to prisoner transfer agreement of lengthy sentence imposed by Thai courts: *inadmissible*

ARTICLE 5

Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty

After conviction

Continued enforcement in United Kingdom pursuant to prisoner transfer agreement of lengthy sentence imposed by Thai courts: *inadmissible*

15.1.2013

[Eweida and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 48420/10](#)

ARTICLE 9

Manifest religion or belief

Disciplinary measures against employees for wearing religious symbols (cross) at work or refusing to perform duties they considered incompatible with their religious beliefs: *violation; no violations*

ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 9)

Disciplinary measures against employees for wearing religious symbols (cross) at work or refusing to perform duties they considered incompatible with their religious beliefs: *violation; no violations*

22.4.2013

[Animal Defenders International v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 48876/08](#)

ARTICLE 10

Article 10 § 1

Freedom of expression

Refusal of permission for non-governmental organisation to place television advert owing to statutory prohibition of political advertising: *no violation*

9.7.2013

[Vinter and Others v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], nos. 66069/09, 130/10 and 3896/10](#)

ARTICLE 3

Degrading treatment

Inhuman treatment

Imprisonment for life with release possible only in the event of terminal illness or serious incapacitation: *violation*

12.7.2013

[Allen v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 25424/09](#)

ARTICLE 6

Article 6 § 2

Presumption of innocence

Refusal of compensation following reversal of applicant's conviction of criminal offence: *no violation*

16.7.2013

[McCaughey and Others v. the United Kingdom, 43098/09](#)

ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

Article 2 § 1

Effective investigation

Excessive delay in investigation into deaths at the hands of security forces in Northern Ireland: *violation*

ARTICLE 46

Article 46 § 2

Execution of judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent State required to take all necessary and appropriate measures to ensure expeditious compliance with procedural requirements of Article 2 in cases concerning killings by the security forces in Northern Ireland