



## List of cases selected for publication in *Reports of Judgments and Decisions* 2012<sup>1</sup>

[Updated June 2013]

### Notes on citation:

Cases are listed alphabetically by applicant and by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by “[GC]”. Decisions are indicated by “(dec.)”.

The volume composition for the years 2012 has not yet been determined. Until further notice, cases of 2012 may be cited simply by indicating the year of publication e.g. ECHR 2012, without adding a volume number. For further information on the manner of citing the Court’s case-law, please see [here](#).

The Court reserves the right to report some or all of the judgments and decisions listed below in the form of extracts. The full original language version or versions of any such judgment or decision will remain available for consultation in the HUDOC database.

## Table of Contents

I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant .....	2
II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State .....	10

---

<sup>1</sup> List approved by the Bureau following recommendation by the Court’s Jurisconsult.

## I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant

---

### A

15.3.2012

[\*\*Aksu v. Turkey \[GC\], nos. 4149/04 and 41029/04\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Publications allegedly insulting to the Roma community: *no violation*

15.3.2012

[\*\*Austin and Others v. United Kingdom \[GC\], nos. 39692/09, 40713/09 and 41008/09\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Containment of peaceful demonstrators within a police cordon for over seven hours:

*Article 5 not applicable; violation*

18.12.2012

[\*\*Ahmet Yildirim v. Turkey, no. 3111/10\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 10**

Freedom of expression

Interim court order incidentally blocking access to host and third-party websites in addition to website concerned by proceedings: *violation*

### B

3.4.2012

[\*\*Boulois v. Luxembourg \[GC\], no. 37575/04\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Civil rights and obligations

Prison board's repeated refusal, with no right of appeal to the administrative courts, to grant prisoner temporary leave: *no violation*

### C

7.6.2012

[\*\*Centro Europa 7 S.R.L. and di Stefano v. Italy \[GC\], no. 38433/09\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 10**

Positive obligations

**Article 10 § 1**

Freedom to impart information

Failure to allocate radiofrequencies to licensed television broadcaster: *violation*

19.10.2012

[Catan and Others v. Moldova and Russia \[GC\], nos. 43370/04, 8252/05 and 18454/06](#)

**ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of states

Jurisdiction of Moldovan and Russian Governments in relation to educational policy within separatist region of the Republic of Moldova

**ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Respect for parents' philosophical convictions

Right to education

Closure of schools teaching in Latin script and harassment of pupils wishing to be educated in their national language: *violation*

D

24.7.2012

[Dordevic v. Croatia, no. 41526/10](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Positive obligations

Violent and persistent harassment of a disabled person by neighbourhood children: *violation*

9.10.2012

[Djokaba Lambi Longa v. the Netherlands \(dec.\), no. 33917/12](#)

**ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of states

Jurisdiction in relation to detention in the United Nations Detention Unit (The Hague) of a Congolese remand prisoner who was transferred to the custody of the International Criminal Court: *inadmissible*

13.12.2012

[De Souza Ribeiro v. France \[GC\], no. 22689/07](#)

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Enforcement of deportation order within fifty minutes after court application for stay of execution was lodged: *violation*

E

25.9.2012

[Eğitim ve Bilim Emekçileri Sendikası v. Turkey, no. 20641/05](#)

**ARTICLE 10**

**Article 10 § 1**

Freedom of expression

Refusal to allow trade union to campaign for education in a mother tongue other than the national language: *violation*

**ARTICLE 11**

**Article 11 § 1**

Freedom of association

Application for trade union's dissolution for supporting right to education in a mother tongue other than the national language: *violation*

13.12.2012

[\*\*El-Masri v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia \[GC\], no. 39630/09\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Torture

Inhuman treatment

Degrading treatment

Effective investigation

Extradition

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment during and following applicant's extraordinary rendition to CIA: *violation*

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1**

Lawful arrest or detention

Detention during and following operation involving extraordinary rendition to CIA: *violation*

F

3.4.2012

[\*\*Francesco Sessa v. Italy, no. 28790/08\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 9**

**Article 9 § 1**

Freedom of religion

Refusal to adjourn a hearing scheduled on a Jewish holiday: *no violation*

G

6.3.2012

[\*\*Gagliano Giorgi v. Italy, no. 23563/07\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 35**

**Article 35 § 3 b)**

No significant disadvantage

Reduction of prison sentence in length-of-criminal-proceedings case: *inadmissible*

15.3.2012

[\*\*Gas and Dubois v. France, no. 25951/07\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination

Refusal of simple adoption order in favour of homosexual partner of biological mother: *no violation*

## H

23.2.2012

[Hirsi Jamaa and Others v. Italy \[GC\], no. 27765/09](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Expulsion

Return of migrants intercepted on the high seas to country of departure: *violation*

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Lack of remedies available for migrants intercepted on the high seas and returned to country of departure: *violation*

**ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

Return of migrants intercepted on the high seas to country of departure: *Article 4 of Protocol No. 4 applicable; violation*

13.11.2012

[Hristozov and Others v. Bulgaria, nos. 47039/11 and 358/12](#)

**ARTICLE 2**

Positive obligations

Life

Refusal to allow the use of an unauthorised experimental drug for medical treatment: *no violation*

**ARTICLE 3**

Positive obligations

Refusal to allow the use of an unauthorised experimental drug for medical treatment: *no violation*

## K

22.3.2012

[Konstantin Markin v. Russia \[GC\], no. 30078/06](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 8)

Difference in treatment between male and female military personnel regarding rights to parental leave: *violation*

26.6.2012

[Kurić and Others v. Slovenia \[GC\], no. 26828/06](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for family life

Respect for private life

Failure to regulate residence of persons who had been “erased” from the permanent residents register following Slovenian independence: *violation*

**ARTICLE 46**

Pilot judgment

General measures

Respondent State required to set up a compensation scheme securing adequate redress to "erased" persons

M

13.7.2012

**[Mouvement raëlien suisse v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 16354/06](#)**

**ARTICLE 10**

**Article 10 § 1**

Freedom of expression

Ban of poster in public space on grounds of displayer's immoral activity and reference to proselytising website: *no violation*

6.12.2012

**[Michaud v. France, no. 12323/11](#)**

**ARTICLE 8**

Private life

Correspondence

Obligation on lawyers to report suspected money laundering by clients unless suspicions based on information obtained when acting for client in court proceedings: *no violation*

N

12.9.2012

**[Nada v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 10593/08](#)**

**ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of States

Jurisdiction in relation to resident of enclaved area who was effectively prevented from travelling as a result of respondent State's implementation of UN Security Council Resolution

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Prohibition on travel through country surrounding enclave: *inadmissible*

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Respect for family life

Prohibition, under legislation implementing UN Security Council Resolutions, on travel through country surrounding enclave: *violation*

## O

17.1.2012

[Othman \(Abu Qatada\) v. the United Kingdom, no. 8139/09](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

Expulsion

**Article 6-1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing

Real risk of evidence obtained by torture of third parties being admitted at the applicant's retrial: *deportation would constitute a violation*

**Article 3**

Expulsion

Detailed assurances from receiving State that high-profile Islamist would not be ill-treated if returned to Jordan: *deportation would not constitute a violation*

10.5.2012

[Özgürlük ve Dayanışma Partisi \(ÖDP\) v. Turkey, no. 7819/03](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 3 of Protocol No. 1)

Refusal of financial aid to political party on grounds that it had not received the statutory minimum number of votes (7%) required to be eligible for aid: *no violation*

## P

16.6.2012

[Poghosyan and Baghdasaryan v. Armenia, no. 22999/06](#)

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 7**

Compensation

Inability of victim of miscarriage of justice to claim compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage: *violation*

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Inability to claim compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage sustained as a result of ill-treatment by the police: *violation*

## S

17.1.2012

[Stanev v. Bulgaria \[GC\], no. 36760/06](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Degrading treatment

Living conditions in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Lawfulness of placement in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

Procedure prescribed by law

Lawfulness of placement in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

**Article 5 § 4**

Take proceedings

Lack of remedies to challenge lawfulness of placement in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Access to court

Lack of direct access to court for person seeking restoration of his legal capacity: *violation*

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Lack of remedies to obtain compensation for poor living conditions in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

**ARTICLE 46**

General measures

Respondent State required to take general measures to ensure effective access to court for persons seeking restoration of their legal capacity

15.3.2012

**[Sitaropoulos and Giakoumopoulos v. Greece \[GC\], no. 42202/07](#)**

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Vote

Lack of legislation covering procedure for Greek nationals resident overseas to vote in parliamentary elections: *no violation*

19.4.2012

**[Sašo Gorgiev v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, no. 49382/06](#)**

**ARTICLE 2**

Positive obligations

**Article 2 § 1**

Life

Non-fatal shooting of a waiter by police officer on unauthorised leave of absence: *violation*

7.6.2012

**[Segame SA v. France, no. 4837/06](#)**

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Access to court

Inability for domestic courts to adjust rate of administrative fine set by law: *no violation*



27.11.2012

[Stamose v. Bulgaria, no. 29713/05](#)

**ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

**Article 2 § 2**

Freedom to leave a country

Ban on travelling abroad following breach of immigration rules of a third-party State: *violation*

V

7.2.2012

[Von Hannover v. Germany \(no. 2\) \[GC\], no. 40660/08](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Positive obligations

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Refusal of domestic courts to issue injunction restraining further publication of a photograph of a famous couple taken without their knowledge: *no violation*

X

3.7.2012

[X. v. Finland, no. 34806/04](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1 c)**

Persons of unsound mind

Forced confinement in a mental institution: *violation*

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Forced administration of therapeutic drugs in mental institution: *violation*

## II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent State

---

### Armenia

16.6.2012

#### [Poghosyan and Baghdasaryan v. Armenia, no. 22999/06](#)

##### **ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 7**

Compensation

Inability of victim of miscarriage of justice to claim compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage: *violation*

##### **ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Inability to claim compensation in respect of non-pecuniary damage sustained as a result of ill-treatment by the police: *violation*

### Bulgaria

17.1.2012

#### [Stanev v. Bulgaria \[GC\], no. 36760/06](#)

##### **ARTICLE 3**

Degrading treatment

Living conditions in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

##### **ARTICLE 5**

###### **Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Lawfulness of placement in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

Procedure prescribed by law

Lawfulness of placement in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

###### **Article 5 § 4**

Take proceedings

Lack of remedies to challenge lawfulness of placement in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

##### **ARTICLE 6**

###### **Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Access to court

Lack of direct access to court for person seeking restoration of his legal capacity: *violation*

##### **ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Lack of remedies to obtain compensation for poor living conditions in a social care home for persons with mental disorders: *violation*

##### **ARTICLE 46**

General measures

Respondent State required to take general measures to ensure effective access to court for persons seeking restoration of their legal capacity

13.11.2012

[Hristozov and Others v. Bulgaria, nos. 47039/11 and 358/12](#)

**ARTICLE 2**

Positive obligations

Life

Refusal to allow the use of an unauthorised experimental drug for medical treatment: *no violation*

**ARTICLE 3**

Positive obligations

Refusal to allow the use of an unauthorised experimental drug for medical treatment: *no violation*

27.11.2012

[Stamose v. Bulgaria, no. 29713/05](#)

**ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 4**

**Article 2 § 2**

Freedom to leave a country

Ban on travelling abroad following breach of immigration rules of a third-party State: *violation*

Croatia

24.7.2012

[Dordevic v. Croatia, no. 41526/10](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Positive obligations

Violent and persistent harassment of a disabled person by neighbourhood children: *violation*

Finland

3.7.2012

[X. v. Finland, no. 34806/04](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1 c)**

Persons of unsound mind

Forced confinement in a mental institution: *violation*

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Forced administration of therapeutic drugs in mental institution: *violation*

## France

15.3.2012

[Gas and Dubois v. France, no. 25951/07](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination

Refusal of simple adoption order in favour of homosexual partner of biological mother: *no violation*

7.6.2012

[Segame SA v. France, no. 4837/06](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Access to court

Inability for domestic courts to adjust rate of administrative fine set by law: *no violation*

6.12.2012

[Michaud v. France, no. 12323/11](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Private life

Correspondence

Obligation on lawyers to report suspected money laundering by clients unless suspicions based on information obtained when acting for client in court proceedings: *no violation*

13.12.2012

[De Souza Ribeiro v. France \[GC\], no. 22689/07](#)

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Enforcement of deportation order within fifty minutes after court application for stay of execution was lodged: *violation*

## Germany

7.2.2012

[Von Hannover v. Germany \(no. 2\) \[GC\], no. 40660/08](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Positive obligations

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Refusal of domestic courts to issue injunction restraining further publication of a photograph of a famous couple taken without their knowledge: *no violation*

## Greece

15.3.2012

### [Sitaropoulos and Giakoumopoulos v. Greece \[GC\], no. 42202/07](#)

#### ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Vote

Lack of legislation covering procedure for Greek nationals resident overseas to vote in parliamentary elections: *no violation*

## Italy

23.2.2012

### [Hirsi Jamaa and Others v. Italy \[GC\], no. 27765/09](#)

#### ARTICLE 3

Expulsion

Return of migrants intercepted on the high seas to country of departure: *violation*

#### ARTICLE 13

Effective remedy

Lack of remedies available for migrants intercepted on the high seas and returned to country of departure: *violation*

#### ARTICLE 4 OF PROTOCOL No. 4

Prohibition of collective expulsion of aliens

Return of migrants intercepted on the high seas to country of departure: *Article 4 of Protocol No. 4 applicable; violation*

6.3.2012

### [Gagliano Giorgi v. Italy, no. 23563/07](#)

#### ARTICLE 35

##### Article 35 § 3 b)

No significant disadvantage

Reduction of prison sentence in length-of-criminal-proceedings case: *inadmissible*

7.6.2012

### [Centro Europa 7 S.R.L. and di Stefano v. Italy \[GC\], no. 38433/09](#)

#### ARTICLE 10

Positive obligations

##### Article 10 § 1

Freedom to impart information

Failure to allocate radiofrequencies to licensed television broadcaster: *violation*

3.4.2012

### [Francesco Sessa v. Italy, no. 28790/08](#)

#### ARTICLE 9

##### Article 9 § 1

Freedom of religion

Refusal to adjourn a hearing scheduled on a Jewish holiday: *no violation*

## Luxembourg

3.4.2012

[Boulois v. Luxembourg \[GC\], no. 37575/04](#)

### ARTICLE 6

#### Article 6 § 1

Civil rights and obligations

Prison board's repeated refusal, with no right of appeal to the administrative courts, to grant prisoner temporary leave: *no violation*

## Moldova

19.10.2012

[Catan and Others v. Moldova and Russia \[GC\], nos. 43370/04, 8252/05 and 18454/06](#)

### ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of states

Jurisdiction of Moldovan and Russian Governments in relation to educational policy within separatist region of the Republic of Moldova

### ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Respect for parents' philosophical convictions

Right to education

Closure of schools teaching in Latin script and harassment of pupils wishing to be educated in their national language: *violation*

## Russia

22.3.2012

[Konstantin Markin v. Russia \[GC\], no. 30078/06](#)

### ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (Article 8)

Difference in treatment between male and female military personnel regarding rights to parental leave: *violation*

19.10.2012

[Catan and Others v. Moldova and Russia \[GC\], nos. 43370/04, 8252/05 and 18454/06](#)

### ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of states

Jurisdiction of Moldovan and Russian Governments in relation to educational policy within separatist region of the Republic of Moldova

### ARTICLE 2 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Respect for parents' philosophical convictions

Right to education

Closure of schools teaching in Latin script and harassment of pupils wishing to be educated in their national language: *violation*

## Slovenia

26.6.2012

### [Kurić and Others v. Slovenia \[GC\], no. 26828/06](#)

#### **ARTICLE 8**

##### **Article 8 § 1**

Respect for family life

Respect for private life

Failure to regulate residence of persons who had been “erased” from the permanent residents register following Slovenian independence: *violation*

#### **ARTICLE 46**

Pilot judgment

General measures

Respondent State required to set up a compensation scheme securing adequate redress to “erased” persons

## Switzerland

13.7.2012

### [Mouvement raëlien suisse v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 16354/06](#)

#### **ARTICLE 10**

##### **Article 10 § 1**

Freedom of expression

Ban of poster in public space on grounds of displayer's immoral activity and reference to proselytising website: *no violation*

12.9.2012

### [Nada v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 10593/08](#)

#### **ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of States

Jurisdiction in relation to resident of enclaved area who was effectively prevented from travelling as a result of respondent State's implementation of UN Security Council Resolution

#### **ARTICLE 5**

##### **Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Prohibition on travel through country surrounding enclave: *inadmissible*

#### **ARTICLE 8**

##### **Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Respect for family life

Prohibition, under legislation implementing UN Security Council Resolutions, on travel through country surrounding enclave: *violation*

## The Netherlands

9.10.2012

[Djokaba Lambi Longa v. the Netherlands\(dec.\), no. 33917/12](#)

### ARTICLE 1

Jurisdiction of states

Jurisdiction in relation to detention in the United Nations Detention Unit (The Hague) of a Congolese remand prisoner who was transferred to the custody of the International Criminal Court: *inadmissible*

## Turkey

15.3.2012

[Aksu v. Turkey \[GC\], nos. 4149/04 and 41029/04](#)

### ARTICLE 8

#### Article 8 § 1

Respect for private life

Publications allegedly insulting to the Roma community: *no violation*

10.5.2012

[Özgürlük ve Dayanışma Partisi \(ÖDP\) v. Turkey, no. 7819/03](#)

### ARTICLE 14

Discrimination (article 3 of Protocol No. 1)

Refusal of financial aid to political party on grounds that it had not received the statutory minimum number of votes (7%) required to be eligible for aid: *no violation*

25.9.2012

[Eğitim ve Bilim Emekçileri Sendikası v. Turkey, no. 20641/05](#)

### ARTICLE 10

#### Article 10§ 1

Freedom of expression

Refusal to allow trade union to campaign for education in a mother tongue other than the national language: *violation*

### ARTICLE 11

#### Article 11 § 1

Freedom of association

Application for trade union's dissolution for supporting right to education in a mother tongue other than the national language: *violation*

18.12.2012

[Ahmet Yildirim v. Turkey, no. 3111/10](#)

### ARTICLE 10

Freedom of expression

Interim court order incidentally blocking access to host and third-party websites in addition to website concerned by proceedings: *violation*



## “The Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia”

19.4.2012

[Sašo Gorgiev v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, no. 49382/06](#)

### ARTICLE 2

Positive obligations

#### Article 2 § 1

Life

Non-fatal shooting of a waiter by police officer on unauthorised leave of absence: *violation*

13.12.2012

[El-Masri v. the former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia \[GC\], no. 39630/09](#)

### ARTICLE 3

Torture

Inhuman treatment

Degrading treatment

Effective investigation

Extradition

Torture and inhuman and degrading treatment during and following applicant's extraordinary rendition to CIA: *violation*

### ARTICLE 5

#### Article 5 § 1

Lawful arrest or detention

Detention during and following operation involving extraordinary rendition to CIA: *violation*

## United Kingdom

17.1.2012

[Othman \(Abu Qatada\) v. the United Kingdom, no. 8139/09](#)

### ARTICLE 6

Expulsion

#### Article 6-1 (criminal)

Fair hearing

Real risk of evidence obtained by torture of third parties being admitted at the applicant's retrial: *deportation would constitute a violation*

#### Article 3

Expulsion

Detailed assurances from receiving State that high-profile Islamist would not be ill-treated if returned to Jordan: *deportation would not constitute a violation*

15.3.2012

[Austin and Others v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], nos. 39692/09, 40713/09 and 41008/09](#)

### ARTICLE 5

#### Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty

Containment of peaceful demonstrators within a police cordon for over seven hours: *Article 5 not applicable; violation*