



## Revised selection of cases for publication in *Reports of Judgments and Decisions 2010*<sup>1</sup>

### Notes on citation:

Cases are listed alphabetically by applicant and by respondent State.

By default, all references are to Chamber judgments. Grand Chamber cases, whether judgments or decisions, are indicated by “[GC]”. Decisions are indicated by “(dec.)”.

The volume composition for the years 2010 has not yet been determined. Until further notice, cases of 2010 may be cited simply by indicating the year of publication e.g. ECHR 2008, without adding a volume number. For further information on the manner of citing the Court’s case-law, please see [here](#).

The Court reserves the right to report some or all of the judgments and decisions listed below in the form of extracts. The full original language version or versions of any such judgment or decision will remain available for consultation in the HUDOC database.

## Table of Contents

I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant by year .....	2
II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent state by year .....	9

---

<sup>1</sup> This selection of cases for publication in the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions* for the year 2010 has been made by the Court’s Jurisconsult and approved by the Bureau. This selection replaces that initially made by the Publications Committee. The HUDOC database and the lists published on the Court’s website, notably the alphabetical and chronological lists, have been amended accordingly. The composition of the *Reports* for the years 1999 to 2006 inclusive remains unchanged.

## I. Cases listed alphabetically by applicant by year

---

### A

16.12.2010

[\*\*A, B and C v. Ireland \[GC\], no. 25579/05\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Restrictions on obtaining an abortion in Ireland: *violation/no violation*

2.3.2010

[\*\*Al-Saadoon and Mufdhi v. the United Kingdom, no. 61498/08\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Inhuman treatment

Transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities despite risk of capital punishment: *violation*

Positive obligations

Transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities despite risk of capital punishment: *violation*

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Appeal to House of Lords rendered ineffective by transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities before appeal could be heard: *violation*

**ARTICLE 34**

Hinder the exercise of the right of petition

Transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities in contravention of interim measure, allegedly because of "objective impediment" making compliance impossible: *violation*

**ARTICLE 46**

Execution of a judgment

Individual measures

Respondent Government required to take all possible steps to obtain assurance from Iraqi authorities that applicants would not be subjected to death penalty

### B

2.11.2010

[\*\*Bachowski v. Poland \(dec.\), no. 32463/06 \(extracts\)\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 7**

New or newly discovered facts

Compensation following reversal of a criminal conviction in the light of a change in political regime: *inadmissible*

## C

16.3.2010

[Carson and Others v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 42184/05](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

Absence of right to index-linking for pensioners resident in overseas countries which had no reciprocal arrangements with the United Kingdom: *no violation*

23.3.2010

[Cudak v. Lithuania \[GC\], no. 15869/02](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Applicability

Proceedings for unfair dismissal by Embassy employee: *Article 6 applicable*

Access to court

Grant of State immunity from jurisdiction in respect of claim for unfair dismissal by Embassy employee: *violation*

## D

1.3.2010

[Demopoulos and Others v. Turkey \(dec.\) \[GC\], nos. 46113/99, 3843/02, 13751/02, 13466/03, 10200/04, 14163/04, 19993/04 and 21819/04](#)

**ARTICLE 35**

**Article 35 § 1**

Exhaustion of domestic remedies

Failure to seek redress from Immovable Property Commission under Law no. 67/2005 in respect of deprivation of property in northern Cyprus in 1974: *inadmissible*

Effective domestic remedy (Turkey)

Failure to seek redress from Immovable Property Commission under Law no. 67/2005 in respect of deprivation of property in northern Cyprus in 1974: *inadmissible*

29.3.2010

[Depalle v. France \[GC\], no. 34044/02](#)

**ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Control of the use of property

Obligation on owners to demolish, at their own expense and without compensation, house they had lawfully purchased on maritime public land: *no violation*

## F

5.1.2010

[Frasik v. Poland, no. 22933/02 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 12**

Right to marry

Refusal to allow a prisoner to marry in prison: *violation*

## G

1.6.2010

[Gäfgen v. Germany \[GC\], no. 22978/05](#)

**ARTICLE 3**

Inhuman treatment

Threats of physical harm by police to establish whereabouts of missing child: *violation*

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing

Use in trial of evidence obtained under duress: *no violation*

**ARTICLE 34**

Victim

Acknowledgment by national authorities of inhuman treatment but without compensation or adequate punishment of offenders: *victim status upheld*

27.7.2010

[Gatt v. Malta, no. 28221/08](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1 (b)**

Non-compliance with court order

Secure fulfilment of obligation prescribed by law

Disproportionate detention for failure to pay amount due for breach of bail conditions: *violation*

12.1.2010

[Gillan and Quinton v. the United Kingdom, no. 4158/05 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Power to stop and search individuals without reasonable suspicion of wrongdoing: *violation*

23.11.2010

[Greens and M.T. v. the United Kingdom, nos. 60041/08 and 60054/08 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 46**

Execution of a judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent State required to take measures to enable serving prisoners to vote.

2.3.2010

[Grosaru v. Romania, no. 78039/01](#)

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Post-election dispute concerning parliamentary representation of a national minority: *violation*

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Free expression of opinion of people

Choice of the legislature

Post-election dispute concerning parliamentary representation of a national minority:  
*violation*

K

17.5.2010

[Kononov v. Latvia \[GC\], no. 36376/04](#)

**ARTICLE 7**

**Article 7 § 1**

*Nullum crimen sine lege*

Conviction under legislation introduced in 1993 for war crimes committed in Second World War: *no violation*

1.7.2010

[Korolev v. Russia \(dec.\), no. 25551/05](#)

**ARTICLE 35**

**Article 35 § 3 (b)**

No significant disadvantage

Complaint concerning inability to recover a judgment debt worth less than one euro:  
*inadmissible*

M

28.9.2010

[Mangouras v. Spain \[GC\], no. 12050/04](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 3**

Release pending trial

Guarantees to appear for trial

Level of recognizance required to secure release on bail of a ship's master in maritime pollution case: *no violation*

29.3.2010

[Medvedyev and Others v. France \[GC\], no. 3394/03](#)

**ARTICLE 1**

Responsibility of States

Jurisdiction of States

Territorial jurisdiction in respect of arrest of foreign vessel on high seas

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 1**

Deprivation of liberty

Procedure prescribed by law

Confinement to ship of crew of foreign vessel arrested on high seas: *violation*

**Article 5 § 3**

Brought promptly before judge or other officer

First appearance before a judge thirteen days after initial detention following arrest of vessel on high seas: *no violation*

N

6.7.2010

[Neulinger and Shuruk v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 41615/07](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for family life

Order for return of child with mother to father's country of residence from which it had been wrongly removed: *forced return would constitute violation*

O

14.12.2010

[O'Donoghue and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 34848/07 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 12**

Right to marry

Requirement of certificate of approval for immigrants wishing to marry other than in the Church of England: *violation*

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 12)

Requirement of certificate of approval for immigrants wishing to marry other than in the Church of England: *violation*

16.3.2010

[Oršuš and Others v. Croatia \[GC\], no. 15766/03](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 2 of Protocol No. 1)

Placement of Roma children in Roma-only classes owing to their allegedly poor command of the Croatian language: *violation*

R

7.1.2010

[Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia, no. 25965/04 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of States

Extent of Court's competence in cases involving international trafficking in human beings

**ARTICLE 2**

**Article 2 § 1**

Effective investigation

Failure by Cypriot authorities to conduct effective homicide investigation, in particular, as regards securing relevant evidence abroad under international convention for mutual assistance: *violation*

#### **ARTICLE 4**

Applicability

Trafficking in human beings: *Article 4 applicable*

Positive obligations

Failure by Cyprus to establish suitable framework to combat trafficking in human beings or to take operational measures to protect victims: *violation*

Failure by Russia to conduct effective investigation into recruitment of a young woman on its territory by traffickers: *violation*

## S

24.6.2010

### [Schalk and Kopf v. Austria, no. 30141/04](#)

#### **ARTICLE 8**

Applicability

Cohabiting same-sex couple living in a stable relationship constitute "Respect for family life": *Article 8 applicable*

#### **ARTICLE 12**

Right to marry

Inability of same-sex couple to marry: *no violation*

#### **ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 8)

Inability of same-sex couple to marry: *no violation*

23.9.2010

### [Schüth v. Germany, no. 1620/03](#)

#### **ARTICLE 8**

##### **Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Respect for family life

Dismissal of church employees for adultery: *no violation/violation*

10.6.2010

### [Schwizgebel v. Switzerland, no. 25762/07 \(extracts\)](#)

#### **ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 8)

Unmarried woman of a certain age debarred from adopting a second child: *no violation*

2.2.2010

### [Sinan Işık v. Turkey, no. 21924/05](#)

#### **ARTICLE 9**

##### **Article 9 § 1**

Freedom of religion

Indication of religion on identity cards: *violation*

#### **ARTICLE 46**

Execution of a judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent State required to remove details of religious affiliation from identity cards

4.5.2010

[Stapleton v. Ireland \(dec.\), no. 56588/07](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing

Surrender of suspect to fellow member State despite alleged risk of unfair trial: *inadmissible*

T

27.4.2010

[Tanase v. Moldova \[GC\], no. 7/08](#)

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Stand for election

Inability of persons with multiple nationality to stand as candidates in parliamentary elections: *violation*

16.11.2010

[Taxquet v. Belgium \[GC\], no. 926/05](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing

Lack of adequate procedural safeguards to enable accused to understand reasons for jury's guilty verdict in assize court: *violation*

U

2.9.2010

[Uzun v. Germany, no. 35623/05](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

GPS surveillance of suspected terrorist: *no violation*

V

27.4.2010

[Vördur Ólafsson v. Iceland, no. 20161/06](#)

**ARTICLE 11**

**Article 11 § 1**

Freedom of association

Liability of non-member to pay contribution to private industrial federation: *violation*



## II. Cases listed alphabetically by respondent state by year

---

### Austria

24.6.2010

[\*\*Schalk and Kopf v. Austria, no. 30141/04\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

Applicability

Cohabiting same-sex couple living in a stable relationship constitute "Respect for family life": *Article 8 applicable*

**ARTICLE 12**

Right to marry

Inability of same-sex couple to marry: *no violation*

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 8)

Inability of same-sex couple to marry: *no violation*

### Belgium

16.11.2010

[\*\*Taxquet v. Belgium \[GC\], no. 926/05\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing

Lack of adequate procedural safeguards to enable accused to understand reasons for jury's guilty verdict in assize court: *violation*

### Croatia

16.3.2010

[\*\*Oršuš and Others v. Croatia \[GC\], no. 15766/03\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 2 of Protocol No. 1)

Placement of Roma children in Roma-only classes owing to their allegedly poor command of the Croatian language: *violation*

### Cyprus

7.1.2010

[\*\*Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia, no. 25965/04 \(extracts\)\*\*](#)

**ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of States

Extent of Court's competence in cases involving international trafficking in human beings

## ARTICLE 2

### Article 2 § 1

Effective investigation

Failure by Cypriot authorities to conduct effective homicide investigation, in particular, as regards securing relevant evidence abroad under international convention for mutual assistance: *violation*

## ARTICLE 4

Applicability

Trafficking in human beings: *Article 4 applicable*

Positive obligations

Failure by Cyprus to establish suitable framework to combat trafficking in human beings or to take operational measures to protect victims: *violation*

Failure by Russia to conduct effective investigation into recruitment of a young woman on its territory by traffickers: *violation*

## France

29.3.2010

### [Depalle v. France \[GC\], no. 34044/02](#)

#### ARTICLE 1 OF PROTOCOL No. 1

Control of the use of property

Obligation on owners to demolish, at their own expense and without compensation, house they had lawfully purchased on maritime public land: *no violation*

29.3.2010

### [Medvedyev and Others v. France \[GC\], no. 3394/03](#)

#### ARTICLE 1

Responsibility of States

Jurisdiction of States

Territorial jurisdiction in respect of arrest of foreign vessel on high seas

#### ARTICLE 5

##### Article 5 § 1

Deprivation of liberty

Procedure prescribed by law

Confinement to ship of crew of foreign vessel arrested on high seas: *violation*

##### Article 5 § 3

Brought promptly before judge or other officer

First appearance before a judge thirteen days after initial detention following arrest of vessel on high seas: *no violation*

## Germany

1.6.2010

### [Gäfgen v. Germany \[GC\], no. 22978/05](#)

#### ARTICLE 3

Inhuman treatment

Threats of physical harm by police to establish whereabouts of missing child: *violation*

#### ARTICLE 6

##### Article 6 § 1 (criminal)

Fair hearing

Use in trial of evidence obtained under duress: *no violation*

**ARTICLE 34**

Victim

Acknowledgment by national authorities of inhuman treatment but without compensation or adequate punishment of offenders: *victim status upheld*

2.9.2010

[Uzun v. Germany, no. 35623/05](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

GPS surveillance of suspected terrorist: *no violation*

23.9.2010

[Schüth v. Germany, no. 1620/03](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Respect for family life

Dismissal of church employees for adultery: *no violation/violation*

Iceland

27.4.2010

[Vördur Ólafsson v. Iceland, no. 20161/06](#)

**ARTICLE 11**

**Article 11 § 1**

Freedom of association

Liability of non-member to pay contribution to private industrial federation: *violation*

Ireland

4.5.2010

[Stapleton v. Ireland \(dec.\), no. 56588/07](#)

**ARTICLE 6**

**Article 6 § 1 (criminal)**

Fair hearing

Surrender of suspect to fellow member State despite alleged risk of unfair trial: *inadmissible*

16.12.2010

[A, B and C v. Ireland \[GC\], no. 25579/05](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Restrictions on obtaining an abortion in Ireland: *violation/no violation*

## Latvia

17.5.2010

### [Kononov v. Latvia \[GC\], no. 36376/04](#)

#### **ARTICLE 7**

##### **Article 7 § 1**

*Nullum crimen sine lege*

Conviction under legislation introduced in 1993 for war crimes committed in Second World War: *no violation*

## Lithuania

23.3.2010

### [Cudak v. Lithuania \[GC\], no. 15869/02](#)

#### **ARTICLE 6**

##### **Article 6 § 1 (civil)**

Applicability

Proceedings for unfair dismissal by Embassy employee: *Article 6 applicable*

Access to court

Grant of State immunity from jurisdiction in respect of claim for unfair dismissal by Embassy employee: *violation*

## Malta

27.7.2010

### [Gatt v. Malta, no. 28221/08](#)

#### **ARTICLE 5**

##### **Article 5 § 1 (b)**

Non-compliance with court order

Secure fulfilment of obligation prescribed by law

Disproportionate detention for failure to pay amount due for breach of bail conditions: *violation*

## Moldova

27.4.2010

### [Tanase v. Moldova \[GC\], no. 7/08](#)

#### **ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Stand for election

Inability of persons with multiple nationality to stand as candidates in parliamentary elections: *violation*

## Poland

5.1.2010

[Frasik v. Poland, no. 22933/02 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 12**

Right to marry

Refusal to allow a prisoner to marry in prison: *violation*

2.11.2010

[Bachowski v. Poland \(dec.\), no. 32463/06 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 7**

New or newly discovered facts

Compensation following reversal of a criminal conviction in the light of a change in political regime: *inadmissible*

## Romania

2.3.2010

[Grosaru v. Romania, no. 78039/01](#)

**ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Post-election dispute concerning parliamentary representation of a national minority: *violation*

**ARTICLE 3 OF PROTOCOL No. 1**

Free expression of opinion of people

Choice of the legislature

Post-election dispute concerning parliamentary representation of a national minority: *violation*

## Russia

7.1.2010

[Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia, no. 25965/04 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 1**

Jurisdiction of States

Extent of Court's competence in cases involving international trafficking in human beings

**ARTICLE 2**

**Article 2 § 1**

Effective investigation

Failure by Cypriot authorities to conduct effective homicide investigation, in particular, as regards securing relevant evidence abroad under international convention for mutual assistance: *violation*

**ARTICLE 4**

Applicability

Trafficking in human beings: *Article 4 applicable*

Positive obligations

Failure by Cyprus to establish suitable framework to combat trafficking in human beings or to take operational measures to protect victims: *violation*

Failure by Russia to conduct effective investigation into recruitment of a young woman on its territory by traffickers: *violation*

1.7.2010

[Korolev v. Russia \(dec.\), no. 25551/05](#)

**ARTICLE 35**

**Article 35 § 3 (b)**

No significant disadvantage

Complaint concerning inability to recover a judgment debt worth less than one euro: *inadmissible*

Spain

28.9.2010

[Mangouras v. Spain \[GC\], no. 12050/04](#)

**ARTICLE 5**

**Article 5 § 3**

Release pending trial

Guarantees to appear for trial

Level of recognizance required to secure release on bail of a ship's master in maritime pollution case: *no violation*

Switzerland

10.6.2010

[Schwizgebel v. Switzerland, no. 25762/07 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 8)

Unmarried woman of a certain age debarred from adopting a second child: *no violation*

6.7.2010

[Neulinger and Shuruk v. Switzerland \[GC\], no. 41615/07](#)

**ARTICLE 8**

**Article 8 § 1**

Respect for family life

Order for return of child with mother to father's country of residence from which it had been wrongly removed: *forced return would constitute violation*

Turkey

2.2.2010

[Sinan Işık v. Turkey, no. 21924/05](#)

**ARTICLE 9**

**Article 9 § 1**

Freedom of religion

Indication of religion on identity cards: *violation*

## **ARTICLE 46**

Execution of a judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent State required to remove details of religious affiliation from identity cards

**1.3.2010**

[\*\*Demopoulos and Others v. Turkey \(dec.\) \[GC\], nos. 46113/99, 3843/02, 13751/02, 13466/03, 10200/04, 14163/04, 19993/04 and 21819/04\*\*](#)

## **ARTICLE 35**

### **Article 35 § 1**

Exhaustion of domestic remedies

Failure to seek redress from Immovable Property Commission under Law no. 67/2005 in respect of deprivation of property in northern Cyprus in 1974: *inadmissible*

Effective domestic remedy (Turkey)

Failure to seek redress from Immovable Property Commission under Law no. 67/2005 in respect of deprivation of property in northern Cyprus in 1974: *inadmissible*

## United Kingdom

**12.1.2010**

[\*\*Gillan and Quinton v. the United Kingdom, no. 4158/05 \(extracts\)\*\*](#)

## **ARTICLE 8**

### **Article 8 § 1**

Respect for private life

Power to stop and search individuals without reasonable suspicion of wrongdoing: *violation*

**2.3.2010**

[\*\*Al-Saadoon and Mufdhi v. the United Kingdom, no. 61498/08\*\*](#)

## **ARTICLE 3**

Inhuman treatment

Transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities despite risk of capital punishment: *violation*

Positive obligations

Transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities despite risk of capital punishment: *violation*

## **ARTICLE 13**

Effective remedy

Appeal to House of Lords rendered ineffective by transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities before appeal could be heard: *violation*

## **ARTICLE 34**

Hinder the exercise of the right of petition

Transfer of detainees to Iraqi authorities in contravention of interim measure, allegedly because of "objective impediment" making compliance impossible: *violation*

## **ARTICLE 46**

Execution of a judgment

Individual measures

Respondent Government required to take all possible steps to obtain assurance from Iraqi authorities that applicants would not be subjected to death penalty

16.3.2010

[Carson and Others v. the United Kingdom \[GC\], no. 42184/05](#)

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 1 of Protocol No. 1)

Absence of right to index-linking for pensioners resident in overseas countries which had no reciprocal arrangements with the United Kingdom: *no violation*

23.11.2010

[Greens and M.T. v. the United Kingdom, nos. 60041/08 and 60054/08 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 46**

Execution of a judgment

Measures of a general character

Respondent State required to take measures to enable serving prisoners to vote.

14.12.2010

[O'Donoghue and Others v. the United Kingdom, no. 34848/07 \(extracts\)](#)

**ARTICLE 12**

Right to marry

Requirement of certificate of approval for immigrants wishing to marry other than in the Church of England: *violation*

**ARTICLE 14**

Discrimination (article 12)

Requirement of certificate of approval for immigrants wishing to marry other than in the Church of England: *violation*